

# **.:ακΣ Consulting:.**

Network for Non Formal Educational Institutions (N-NFEI)

<p><b>EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL REPORTS (INTERIM &amp; FINAL)</b></p>
---

**To**

**AFRINIC Ltd.**

**Patricia SENHOR – Cooperation & Project Development Manager**

**By**

**SANVI & Co.**

**Kenneth SANVI, PMP – Consultant in International Development**

## Table of Contents

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>I. CONTEXT AND DESCRIPTION</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>II. PURPOSE AND EXPECTED USE</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>III. OBJECTIVES</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>IV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>V. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>THE EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>1.1. PURPOSE</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>1.2. AUDIENCE AND USE</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>1.3. OBJECTIVES</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>1.4. METHODOLOGY</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>1.5. TEAM</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>2. THE PROJECT</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>2.1. CONTEXT</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>1. 2.2. UNDERLYNG RATIONALE</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>2.3. STAKEHOLDERS AND BENEFICIARIES</b> .....	<b>11</b>
2.3.1. Stakeholders.....	11
<b>2.4. CONCEPTUAL MODEL</b> .....	<b>11</b>
2.4.1. Resources and activities.....	11
<b>2.5. RESULT CHAIN AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<b>2.6. PROJECT MONITORING SYSTEM</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>2.7. EVALUATION FINDINGS</b> .....	<b>14</b>
2.7.1. DESIGN .....	14
2.7.2. EFFECTIVENESS.....	15
<b>2.8. RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>17</b>

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## ***I. CONTEXT AND DESCRIPTION***

FIRE is a Grant and Awards program designed by AFRINIC in order to support and encourage the development of solutions to information and communication needs in the Africa Region. It places particular emphasis on the role of the Internet in the social and economic development for the benefit of the African community.

Launched in May 2012, the program is partly funded by two donors: IDRC and SIDA International Development Agencies. In 2013, AFRINIC selected eleven grant recipients which received 10 000 USD each for their project.

The grantees are bound by several obligations, which are among other things:

- Implementation and use of the project funds solely to perform the objectives and activities of their project
- Use the funds in accordance with the budget set out in their application
- Submission of an Interim and a Final Report in accordance with AFRINIC's report guidelines outlined in the Memorandum of Grant Conditions.

## ***II. PURPOSE AND EXPECTED USE***

AFRINIC required this evaluation in order to confirm that the project is run in accordance with the following criteria:

- Quality and reliance of design
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency of implementation
- Impact and potential of sustainability
- Replicability

AFRINIC also requires this evaluation to be run on the basis of the Interim and Financial Reports sent by the project in accordance with their obligations.

### **III. OBJECTIVES**

AFRINIC requires this evaluation to ensure of the following:

- The project meets identified objectives;
- Enhance the Design and the implementation of FIRE programme;
- Demonstrate and Improve the impact of the various projects on the local community;
- Develop recommendations to improve the implementation and the monitoring of future projects;
- Ensure that funds allocated to the various projects are used efficiently and within the initial identified scope.

### **IV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS**

This evaluation, based on interim and final reports provided by the N-NFEI project, highlighted some weaknesses on canvas of reports proposed and on the understanding that the project team may have had of reporting expectations. Indeed, elements contained in both reports have unfortunately failed to provided needed information necessary to:

1. Produce a detailed and comprehensive assessment of the various stages of the project life cycle and;
2. Measure the project's achievements and possible impact.

**The evaluation, based on information provided by project team, leads us to conclude that most of the objectives have been achieved and that results were obtained.**

Nevertheless, we deplore the lack of information pertaining to the management of the project as well as clear evidences of achievement of goals.

### **V. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS**

For evaluations to be meaningful and help align the objectives of FIRE Programme, we recommend that amendment be made on reporting template. We thus recommend the following:

- To review the proposed project report template so as to ensure that objectives, mile stones and achievement timelines are clearly highlighted;
- To ensure that project managers clearly understand what is expected of them in reports.

# **THE EVALUATION**

## **1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

### **1.1. PURPOSE**

AFRINIC required this evaluation in order to confirm that the project is run in accordance with the following criteria:

- Quality and reliance of design
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency of implementation
- Impact and potential of sustainability
- Replicability

AFRINIC also requires this evaluation to be run on the basis of the Interim and Financial Reports sent by the project in accordance with their obligations.

AFRINIC requires this evaluation to ensure of the following:

- The project meets identified objectives;
- Enhance the Design and the implementation of FIRE programme;
- Demonstrate and Improve the impact of the various projects on the local community;
- Develop recommendations to improve the implementation and the monitoring of future projects;
- Ensure that funds allocated to the various projects are used efficiently and within the initial identified scope.

This evaluation is also required by AFRINIC in order to help the project in its implementation in accordance with the Memorandum of Grant Conditions.

### **1.2. AUDIENCE AND USE**

The stakeholders who will make use of the evaluation reports are:

1. FIRE programme – AFRINIC
2. International Development Research Center (IDRC)
3. Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA)

4. The grantees
5. Prospective applicants to FIRE program

### **1.3. OBJECTIVES**

AFRINIC requires this evaluation to ensure of the following:

- The project meets identified objectives;
- Enhance the Design and the implementation of FIRE programme;
- Demonstrate and Improve the impact of the various projects on the local community;
- Develop recommendations to improve the implementation and the monitoring of future projects;
- Ensure that funds allocated to the various projects are used efficiently and within the initial identified scope.

### **1.4. METHODOLOGY**

The evaluation methodology is linked with the objectives, the evaluation questions and the type of evaluation.

<b>Evaluation criteria</b>	<b>Key Results Areas</b>	<b>Evaluation questions</b>	<b>Data sources</b>
<b>Design</b>	Assess the extent to which the project responds to priority issues and identified objectives.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are the project objectives still valid?</li> <li>• Has the project team put in place the appropriate strategies?</li> <li>• Are there major risks that have not been taken into account?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Design documentation.</li> <li>• Project objectives.</li> <li>• Interim and final technical reports.</li> </ul>
<b>Effectiveness</b>	Assess the project major key results.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Are the obtained results aligned with planed objectives?</li> <li>• Are the results in</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Interim and final technical reports.</li> <li>• Project management</li> </ul>

		acceptable both in terms of the quantity and their quality?	plan. • Result monitoring report.
<b>Efficiency</b>	Assess the extent to which:  - Project plan has been followed;  - Project reports are up to date.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To which percentage has project plan been achieved to date?</li> <li>• Are expenses aligned with established budget?</li> <li>• Have data collected archived for future use?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project management plan.</li> <li>• Monitoring and control reports.</li> <li>• Financial reports.</li> <li>• Interim and final technical reports.</li> </ul>
<b>Impact</b>	Assess to which extent the project will have a long-term positive impact on local community.	To which extent has the project's general objectives and final goals been achieved?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project objectives</li> <li>• Interim and final technical reports.</li> <li>• FIRE programme objectives</li> </ul>
<b>Sustainability</b>	Assess to which extent the project has been socially and politically adopted by the local community.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will the project contribute to long-term benefits?</li> <li>• Would the long-term benefits be materialized by the implementation of an organization?</li> <li>• What are the costs implications for scaling up impact?</li> <li>• Are there savings that could be made without compromising delivery?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project benefits report.</li> <li>• Project cost report.</li> <li>• Project monitoring report.</li> </ul>



### **1.5. TEAM**

**M. Kenneth SANVI, PMP**, is a Canadian Consultant in International Development, specialized in all areas of project management. M. SANVI is a seasoned expert with many audits and evaluations projects in several countries in Africa. He is also a trainer in many areas among which, monitoring and evaluation.

**Ms. Rebecca GIDEON, CISA** will perform the evaluation of Information Technology aspects of the reports. Ms. Gideon is an experienced Information Technology professional with over seven years of diversified experience.

## **2. THE PROJECT**

### **2.1. CONTEXT**

Provision of basic education is a right for all Kenyans as provided for in the new constitution. The Millennium Development Goals (MDG) and Vision 2030 identify education as a major pillar in development and poverty eradication.

Access to secondary education has been very low in slum areas due to lack of public secondary schools and cost related aspects.

Kenya Certificate for Secondary Education (KCSE) certificate is now referred to as the basic academic qualification for any form of employment in Kenya. Majority of slums and marginalized communities, children graduating from primary levels are not able to translate to secondary schools due to social economic reasons. This hinders them from accessing any form of meaningful employment in the Kenyan job market and thus reducing their chance of changing their social economic status.

Elimu TV and on line platforms will enabling every child in Kenya access quality secondary education and support and compete equally in National exam with other students wherever they may be. This platform will provide teachers in Non-Formal Schools quality content that can be displayed in class using a laptop and a projector. This will be helpful for cases where one textbook is shared among 5 children and others where the only textbook is the teachers copy.

For schools without science laboratories this will be the best place for science subjects because experiments are well displayed in videos. This is a platform where children and youth can go for tuition and extra learning in a technology based methodology, which is more interesting.

### **1. 2.2. UNDERLYING RATIONALE**

The objectives of the project are listed below:

- i. Develop Digital content for Biology, Mathematics, Physics, Kiswahili and Fasihi on selected topics that will support revision for form 4 students.
- ii. Establish six Non Formal TV/Digital Schools,
- iii. Make Adult Education Centers TV Schools

- iv. Establish TV Schools in Prisons
- v. Host the content on Elimu TV and Elimu on line

## **2.3. STAKEHOLDERS AND BENEFICIARIES**

### **2.3.1. Stakeholders**

- a) FIRE programme – AFRINIC
- b) International Development Research Center (IDRC)
- c) Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA)
- d) The grantees
- e) Prospective applicants to FIRE program
- f) Teachers
- g) Students
- h) N-NFEI Management
- i) Ministry of Education
- j) Adult Education department
- k) Prisons

### **2.3.2. Beneficiaries**

- a) Teachers
- b) Students
- c) N-NFEI Management
- d) Ministry of Education
- e) Adult Education department
- f) Prisons

## **2.4. CONCEPTUAL MODEL**

### **2.4.1. Resources and activities**

Activities resulting from N-NFEI could be grouped as follow:

- a) Contracting staff
- b) Contracting partners
- c) Volunteers
- d) Content development
- e) Training of staff
- f) Identification of schools
- g) M&E meetings

- h) Conference
- i) Social media platform
- j) Report writing

**2.4.2. Expected results**

Results expected from the project are as follow:

- a) Videos produced in 5 different areas (Mathematics, Biology, Physics, Swahili, Fasihi)
- b) Teachers and center managers trained on the use of Skype
- c) Identify schools and education center
- d) Create a social media platform
- e) Produce two reports

**2.5. RESULT CHAIN AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

<b>Input</b>	<b>Project activities</b>	<b>Outputs</b>	<b>Outcomes</b>
Salaries 290,000 Comm- 32,000 Rent- 90,000	Contracting Staff	1 Director 3 Teachers 1 Office Staff	Staff in place
	Contracting Partners	Elimu Digital Media offering Technical Support	EDM offering all video shoting services
	Volunteers	3 volunteers on technical	3 students from local media schools are volunteering with the program
Content Development 150,000	Content Development	Videos done in Mathematics Biology	Video produced in five subjects ready

		Physics Swahili Fasihi	
	Training of Staff	Teachers and center managers trained on the use of Skype	Teachers have Skype accounts and have skills to teach on the same
	Identification of schools	6 Non formal schools indentified to take up the program  Adult Education Center  Support Prisoners with content	Schools prepared to start learning with Elimu TV  Will start learning from Elimu TV IN 2014  Establish TV Schools in Prisons
20,000	M&E Meetings	6 meetings held at Executive and Staff Level	6 meeting with staff members  6 meeting with the Chairman and the teacher of N-NFEI
56,000	Conference	4 conference and forums attended	AFRINIC in Zambia IGF Kenya where a paper was presented IGF Africa International Literacy Day

	Social Media Platform	We have a face book page and Elimu on You -Tube	Elimu on line Elimu TV on YOUTUBE
20,000	Report Writing	Narative and Financial Report	Quaterly and Final Report

## **2.6. PROJECT MONITORING SYSTEM**

Each month a meeting has been held by the members of the staff in order to monitor the implementation of the project. This activity has been completed and helped the staff to produce a database of the challenges faced by the team during the project.

## **2.7. EVALUATION FINDINGS**

### **2.7.1. DESIGN**

Regarding the project design, it is to be noted that there has been a realignment of initial objectives. Thus, during the implementation phase, the following two objectives not previously identified, were added:

- (i) Make Adult Education Centers TV Schools
  - (ii) Establish TV Schools in Prisons
- Project Objectives

Project objectives still seem valid. As a matter of fact, the project main objective was to allow each child in Kenya access to quality secondary education and ensure that he or she can compete equally with other children. That overall objective remains valid though a project of this size and nature is not sufficient to achieve the goal. It must be understood that a set of actions are necessary to achieve desired results and that the project objectives will remain valid as long as there remains children who have not completed their secondary education.

➤ Appropriate strategies

Interim and final reports submitted do not provide necessary elements for the evaluation team to pose a diagnostic on the strategies adopted by the project team. Additional information was sought to be able to evaluate the strategy adopted but the response received was more of actions posed to achieve ending results. Global strategies shall be identified at the planning stage of the project and be validated by programme manager and donors.

➤ Major risks not accounted for

A major key element for the success of the project is Internet connectivity. As highlighted in the final report, Internet connectivity is a challenge in slum areas in Kenya and remains quite costly nationwide. To mitigate this risk, the project team met with the Communications Commission of Kenya in December 2013 following which a fund was established that would enable marginalised and hard to reach area access to Internet and connectivity. The fund's logistics are yet to be finalised.

## 2.7.2. EFFECTIVENESS

➤ Results aligned with planed objectives

Obtained results described in the final report are aligned with plan objectives. Despite the fact that many actions remained to be taken during 2014 calendar year, it is our opinion that most of goals identified were achieved.

➤ Results acceptability

Interim and final reports do not enable us to judge of the acceptability of the results in terms of quality. In effect, though the results appear to be consistent in terms of quantity with pursued objectives, it would be difficult to conclude that they are sufficient and acceptable. We believe that it is important to emphasize the balance between the expected results and the outcomes in terms of quality.

The implementation phase of the project should have clearly highlighted expectations in terms of quantity and quality of the results but as we pointed above, many shortcomings were deplored. Consequently, we recommend that reports provide more data samples in order to evaluate both the quantity and the quality of results.

### 2.7.3. EFFICIENCY OF PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION

- Percentage of achieved project plan

To date, based on interim and final reports, we could conclude that all aspects of the project plan, with the exception of the media platform, were achieved. It is to be noted that the implementation of the media platform is a continuous action.

- Expenses aligned with budget

There is an important cost variation to be noted for technical support. This variation of KSH 30,000 has a serious impact on the overall budget and would be important that the financial report clearly states the reasons for such additional cost.

Additional information provided by the project team indicates that the variation was the result of measures taken to cope with connectivity issues. Skype was first attempted but failed due to lack of proper Internet access.

- Archive of collected data

Once again, the lack of information in both the intermediary as well as the final report does not enable us to ascertain that archiving of data is being performed.

### 2.7.4. IMPACT

- General objectives and final goals achieved

We would like to point out that results alone are not sufficient to evaluate the impact of a project. However, it should be noted that the project objectives can be formulated as a first step in achieving overall objectives.

Several actions are undertaken within project scope to ensure the replicability of results. As such, we could note the Network for Non Formal Educational Institutions regularly promotes the benefits of the project with key stakeholders to get a better adhesion of the latter. The technical report also brings out the desire to integrate schools both private and public in the program. Nevertheless, no concrete actions have been highlighted in the reports to show sustainability and replicability.

- Long-term benefits contribution

This project could contribute to long-term profits provided it is integrated into a much broader plan. In addition, it is important that adequate and additional funding be in place to support the



sustainability of results. In a context where it would be considered an isolated action, it is clear that this project would not contribute to long-term benefits.

## **2.8. RECOMMENDATIONS**

Interim and final reports should contain evidences allowing one to clearly identify all aspects of the design and the implementation of a project. Precise and specific progress reports allow better monitoring of the implementation process and evaluate the extent of successful achievement of project objectives.

Neither interim nor final report presented miles stones and a clear timeline of achievement. Though objectives identified have been met, we do not have any element to evaluate the success of the project based on the triple constraint factors: scope, time and cost.

This evaluation, instead of being based on concrete achievements of the project ended up being limited to one based on the vision that the project team had of its work. Many elements are lacking to make a comprehensive and objective assessment.

We thus recommend the following:

- i. To review the proposed project report template so as to ensure that objectives, mile stones and achievement timelines are clearly highlighted;
- ii. To ensure that project managers clearly understand what is expected of them in reports.